

STEVE W. BERMAN (*pro hac vice*)  
ROBERT B. CAREY (*pro hac vice to be filed*)  
THOMAS E. LOESER (SBN 202724)  
HAGENS BERMAN SOBOL SHAPIRO LLP  
1918 Eighth Avenue, Suite 3300  
Seattle, Washington 98101  
Telephone: (206) 623-7292  
Facsimile: (206) 623-0594  
steve@hbsslaw.com  
rob@hbsslaw.com  
toml@hbsslaw.com

*Attorneys for David Fiol, Benpayo Plaintiffs, Hill  
Plaintiffs, Steffenson Plaintiffs, Clarke Plaintiffs,  
Alex Barkaloff, and Burden Plaintiffs*

*[Additional counsel listed on signature page.]*

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

IN RE: VOLKSWAGEN “CLEAN DIESEL”  
MARKETING, SALES PRACTICES, AND  
PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION

THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO ALL  
ACTIONS

Case No. 3:15-md-02672-CRB

**PLAINTIFF DAVID FIOL, BENPAYO  
PLAINTIFFS, CLARKE PLAINTIFFS,  
HILL PLAINTIFFS, STEFFENSEN  
PLAINTIFFS, ALEX BARKALOFF,  
AND BURDEN PLAINTIFFS  
RECOMMENDATION FOR SPECIAL  
SETTLEMENT MASTER SUBMITTED  
PURSUANT TO PRE-TRIAL ORDER  
NO. 1.<sup>1</sup>**

---

<sup>1</sup> The undersigned counsel represents 196 class representative plaintiffs from each state in the Union and the District of Columbia who were named in two class actions that were filed in this District and five class actions that have been or will be transferred to this Court by the MDL Panel. For ease of reading, counsel will refer to their named class representative clients by the first named plaintiff in each class action and have attached a table with each named class representative plaintiff as Exhibit A.

Pursuant to this Court's Pre-Trial Order No. 1, dated December 9, 2015 (Dkt. No. 2), Plaintiffs David Fiol, Benipayo Plaintiffs, Hill Plaintiffs, Steffensen Plaintiffs, Clarke Plaintiffs, Alex Barkaloff, and Burden Plaintiffs, through their counsel Hagens Berman Sobol Shapiro LLP and Quinn Emanuel Urquhart and Sullivan LLP, respectfully recommend the Court appoint a single special settlement master. Counsel propose the following candidates: Hon. Layn Phillips, Hon. Edward Infante, or Mag. Judge Joseph Spero.

Counsel do not make this recommendation in a vacuum, based only upon prior working experience with these candidates on other, necessarily different, cases. Rather, as detailed below, counsel have: (1) developed a wealth of knowledge pertaining directly to this case from our extensive client contacts and significant work to date with the leading experts on the issues presented here; and (2) been lead or co-lead in the three largest automotive defect economic loss cases in US History; and in the case of Quinn Emanuel, advised defendants in those cases. With this basis of knowledge and experience, counsel make their recommendations with confidence that appointment of one of these candidates will significantly assist the parties and the Court in advancing resolution of this case to the full extent and as expeditiously as possible.

#### **I. COUNSELS' KNOWLEDGE PERTAINING TO THIS CASE**

As noted in the MDL Panel's consolidation order, Hagens Berman filed the first class action against Volkswagen concerning its diesel emissions fraud on September 18, 2015. Hagens Berman and Quinn Emanuel have filed six additional class actions with 196 class representative plaintiffs from every state and the District of Columbia. In total, 1,813 California residents, and 7,067 TDI owners from throughout the United States, have engaged Hagens Berman to represent them for their claims against VW. Over 13,160 TDI owners have requested that Hagens Berman represent them, or provide them with ongoing updates and information concerning this litigation. Beginning in early November and continuing today, Hagens Berman distributed a detailed damages survey to TDI owners from which we have received 3,056 responses.

#### **II. COUNSELS' DIRECT EXPERIENCE IN THE LARGEST AUTOMOTIVE DEFECT ECONOMIC LOSS CASES IN THE U.S.**

In responding to the Court's inquiry regarding a Special Settlement Master, and in response

1 to recommendations that multiple masters be appointed, the undersigned counsel bring unparalleled  
 2 experience in handling nationwide automotive defect cases and have perhaps unique insight into  
 3 what would be most helpful in this case. Briefly, for the Court's benefit in understanding the basis  
 4 for counsel's view, Steve Berman was lead counsel in the Toyota Sudden Unintended Acceleration  
 5 (SUA) litigation, in which Toyota owners obtained the largest automotive economic loss settlement  
 6 in history, valued at over \$1.6 billion. Mr. Berman is currently co-lead counsel in the GM Ignition  
 7 Switch Defect litigation, which may even surpass Toyota in scope and recovery to class members.  
 8 Hagens Berman was also lead counsel in the Hyundai/Kia MPG Fraud litigation, which resulted in  
 9 the second largest automotive class recovery of \$255 million.

10 Quinn Emanuel was lead defense counsel in the Hyundai/Kia MPG Fraud litigation, and  
 11 has served as lead counsel in more than 20 MDL proceedings. Quinn Emanuel's perspective on  
 12 the advantages of a single settlement master is informed by experience representing both plaintiffs  
 13 and defendants in these numerous MDLs.

### 14 **III. APPOINTMENT OF A SINGLE SETTLEMENT MASTER IS** 15 **APPROPRIATE IN THIS CASE**

16 Respectfully, we submit that appointment of a single settlement master is not only  
 17 adequate, but will be more efficient and more likely to resolve this litigation as expeditiously as  
 18 reasonably possible. This belief is based on over 3,050 responses to our damages survey,  
 19 information from our experts, and counsels' extensive experience in cases very much like this case,  
 20 including cases which involved foreign manufacturers and wrongdoing committed abroad. These  
 21 cases were resolved efficiently and fairly with a single settlement master or without one at all.

22 The survey responses from our several thousand clients do not evidence any great disparity  
 23 in the expectations of consumers in the several states. We successfully have negotiated and  
 24 implemented numerous nationwide economic loss cases including Toyota SUA and Hyundai/Kia  
 25 MPG. That various models and model years are affected is also not unique to this case. Both  
 26 Toyota and Hyundai/Kia involved many models of vehicles and Toyota spanned 13 years of model  
 27 production. Nonetheless, comprehensive settlements which fairly differentiated recoveries among  
 28 the model years and vehicle types were reached without multiple special settlement masters.

Likewise, the existence of parallel government investigations does not render the case unmanageable by a single settlement master. There were multiple parallel government investigations in Toyota SUA and Hyundai MPG, and there are both civil and criminal investigations on parallel tracks with the GM Ignition Switch litigation. Parallel government investigations were not a hindrance to settlement in Toyota SUA and Hyundai/Kia MPG, and we do not believe they will be a hindrance in GM Ignition Switch or in this case.

A single special master, with an overall understanding and view of the case, will likely be key to a possible early resolution. The persons being proposed in the many submissions on this issue are accomplished and in demand, and trying to schedule around multiple busy calendars will complicate, not streamline the matter. Continuous dialogue with one skilled special master whose schedule allows a significant time commitment to this case should be the goal.

Provided his schedule would allow the necessary time and degree of commitment, Hon. Layn Phillips would be an excellent Special Master in this case, as would Hon. Edward Infante. Alternatively, counsel suggests appointing Judge Joseph C. Spero, with whom the Court could comprehensively integrate settlement discussions and the many other early issues that will arise in this case. Judge Spero's intellect, ingenuity, attention to detail and tremendous work ethic have proved invaluable and made him highly successful in the resolution of numerous large class cases, including cases where he has worked with this Court.

DATED: December 15, 2015                      HAGENS BERMAN SOBOLEW SHAPIRO LLP

By           /s/ Steve W. Berman            
STEVE W. BERMAN

Steve W. Berman (*pro hac vice*)  
Robert B. Carey (*pro hac vice to be filed*)  
Thomas E. Loeser (202724)  
**HAGENS BERMAN SOBOL SHAPIRO LLP**  
1918 8th Avenue, Suite 3300  
Seattle, Washington 98101  
Tel: (206) 623-7292  
Fax: (206) 623-0594  
steve@hbsslaw.com  
rob@hbsslaw.com  
toml@hbsslaw.com

1 John B. Quinn  
2 Shon Morgan  
3 QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART & SULLIVAN, LLP  
4 865 South Figueroa Street, 10th Floor  
5 Los Angeles, California 90017-2543  
6 Tel: (213) 443 3000  
7 Fax: (213) 443 3100  
8 johnquinn@quinnemanuel.com  
9 shonmorgan@quinnemanuel.com

*Attorneys for David Fiol, Benipayo Plaintiffs, Hill Plaintiffs,  
Steffensen Plaintiffs, Clarke Plaintiffs, Alex Barkaloff, and  
Burden Plaintiffs.*

10 **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

11 I hereby certify that on December 15, 2015, I electronically transmitted the attached  
12 documents to the Court Clerk using the ECF System for filing. The Clerk of the Court will transmit  
13 a Notice of Electronic Filing to all ECF registrants.

14 By /s/ Steve W. Berman  
15 STEVE W. BERMAN  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

## EXHIBIT A

1			
2	<b>FIOL v. VOLKSWAGEN</b>	<b>3:15-cv-04278 (N.D. Cal.)</b>	<b>9/18/2015</b>
3	DAVID FIOL		
4	<b>BENIPAYO v. VOLKSWAGEN</b>	<b>3:15-cv-04314 (N.D. Cal.)</b>	<b>9/21/2015</b>
5	NICHOLAS BENIPAYO	ANTHONY DEMARTINO	EMILY FISHER
6	MARK CARNETT	PETAR RAMADANOVIC	KSHANTI GREENE
7	DANIEL ROBINSON	CHRISTOPHER MONROE	JOHN HALLORAN
8	JONATHON HORACEK	MELISSA BRACKEN	SCOTT MOEN
9	STEFANIE BEAUDREAULT	REZEDA DOZIER	GRANT GALL
10	JAMES BABIAK	JOHN DULL	VAN HAYNES
11	DAVID GOODSON	MELISSA FEDORCZYK	ALFRED HOWE
12	JOSHUA CAMPBELL	DAVID ANTELLOCY	
13	<b>STEFFENSEN v.</b>		
14	<b>VOLKSWAGEN</b>	<b>1:15-cv-1218 (E.D. Va.)</b>	<b>9/23/2015</b>
15	KIRK STEFFENSON	CHARLES HALL	SUSAN WALL
16	SUSAN TARRENCE	REBECCA PERLMUTTER	CARL JOHNSON
17			ALEXANDER
18	TERRY HIGHT	JOE HARRISON	LASKOVSKI
19	SARAH MUTKA	DAVID SIBLEY	ROBERTA DUBOISE
20	MARK WEBER	MATTHEW HEINLY	JESSICA ALBER
21	DAVID WINTERS	RACHEL SULLIVAN	LAURA SWENSON
22	ALEXANDER VALDES	HERB YUSSIM	JOSHUA MILLER
23	DAVID MANN	CHRISTOPHER MITZAK	
24	<b>HILL v. VOLKSWAGEN</b>	<b>2:15-cv-07604 (C.D. Cal.)</b>	<b>9/28/2015</b>
25	JESS HILL	CHRISTINA PAOLICCHI	MATTHEW
26	KEVIN JENTES	ADAM FRUGOLI	OLOVSON
27	MALIA SIAS	TRACEY ROSEN	WILLIAM MACKEY
28	ARTHUR SCHAREIN	JEFFREY BRADY	EDWARD SIMMONS
		BOUALIVANH	CHARLES HALL
	MICHAEL BOZINE	PHANHPHONGSANE	KOTAB HOLDINGS
	CLIFFORD BROUSSARD	BRENDA PENNEY	LLC
	VICTORIA MCCLELLAND	MICHAEL ANTIS	ALAN BRANTING
	JEREMIAH HOLDEN	ALEX ARCENEUX	CHAD RAMOS
	HILDEGARD REISER, M.D.	G. KEATING PEPPER	STEVEN BOLDUC
	SPENCER MOORE	DEVAN WANG	JOSEPH AVENA
	JOHN GAUGER	ROBERT HOOKER	ANDREW MASTERS
	HANAA RIFAEY	GARY VAN GUILDER	STEVEN KOLPAN
			PAUL PURYEAR
	DEBORAH MARKWARD	BARRY CROSS	MICHELLE
	JOHN BROWN	JUSTIN HOLLOWAY	GRAMLING
			DAVID PYLE

1	CARLOS ORTIZ	KELLY KING	HEATHER
2	BRIAN MILLS	KAREN NORMAN	GREENFIELD
3	SCOTT TAYLOR	ANDREW VENTURA	KYLE BOYLAND
4	ANDREW BELL	TROY PONTO	RALPH
5			MENDENHALL
6	<b>BARKALOFF v.</b>		ALEXANDER
7	<b>VOLKSWAGEN</b>	<b>2:15-cv-07997 (C.D. Cal.)</b>	BAITTINGER
8	ALEX BARKALOFF		
9		<b>2:15-cv-07549-JLL-JAD</b>	
10	<b>CLARKE v. VOLKSWAGEN</b>	<b>(D.N.J.)</b>	<b>10/16/2015</b>
11	AMY CLARKE	MATTHEW MIKULSKY	DONALD ALLEN
12	MARK GJONBALAJ	RICHARD GROGAN	LUIS MORENO
13	JOHN MCLAUGHLIN	CHAD DIAL	CHARLES NICOLOSI
14	KELLY MULLIGAN-		
15	MAHONEY	LORI EDWARDS	ALFRED GOLDEN
16	SHARON RANSVAGE	TAMARA LYMAN	JACK SANDELMAN
17	DAVID RIEN	ERIC WHITE	LINDA HUNT
18	DAVID SIBLEY	WILLIAM PREININGER	DAPHNE MARCYAN
19	MARK HOULE	DANIEL OHLSTEIN	PAUL HARRIS
20	KURT MALLORY	DORIE MALLORY	HEATHER LEMELLE
21	JOAN DUDLEY	WENDY GOLDNER	HARRY WALSH
22	MARYBETH WINKLER	BRIAN BIALECKI	ANDREW FRANZ
23	CATHERINE ROBERTS	DAWN BOULWARE	WARREN COFFIN
24	JOSEPH COLLESANO	ANGELA WAGNER	CESAR OLMOS
25	SIMON BEAVEN	CHARLES ROBBINS	THOMAS LASKO
26	STEVE MORTILLARO	THOMAS BUCHBERGER	JOHN GAMBLE
27			LESLIE MACLISE-
28	RYAN GEIER	CARLA BERG	KANE
	DANIEL SULLIVAN	KYLE TISDEL	JASON HILL
	BARRY GLUSTOFF	CRAIG LYBARGER	AARON JOY
	THOMAS AYALA	BRITNEY SCHNATHORST	ROBERT MILLER
			RAMON SAN
	JAMES BERGMANN	JONATHON RODGERS	NICOLAS
	<b>BURDEN v. VOLKSWAGEN</b>	<b>2:15-cv-09125 (C.D. Cal.)</b>	<b>11/24/2015</b>
	DENNIS BURDEN	NATHAN FORBES	TODD SCHWARZ
	PATRICIO BURILLO	JOSH GOLDEN	MATTHEW SNYDER
			DOUGLAS
	JOHN CHAPMAN	MICHAEL GUILBAULT	STEWART
	SAMUEL CLARK	CHISEPE GVARADA	NATHAN STRICKER

1	JEREMY CODER	YOON KYO HAN	MORTON KENT
2	COBY COHEN	PETER HARPER	TAYLOR
3	PAUL-MATTHIEU COSTE	JONATHAN HUGGETT	ANDREW WALKER
4	RUSSEL CRONQUIST	RYAN HURST	CONSTANCE
5	CHERYL DEWORKEN	SUSAN KEOHAN	WOLFSON
6	JAIME DREIKOSEN	ERIK MIKKELSEN	PENGHUI XUE
7	TIM ELDRIDGE	ALEXANDER POLILLO	ROMAN
8	QIANG FENG	JEROME FOHET	ZVYAGELSKY
9			RICHARD
10			REMINGTON
11			ROBERT RIFKIN
12			
13			
14			
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			
28			